श्री इकबाल सिंह : सर, माननीय मंत्रीजी ने अपने उत्तर में बताया कि पंजाब की जो बिजली है उसको राजस्थान को दिया जाता है। मैं मंत्रीजी से यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि 71 परसेंट फ्रूट पंजाब का फार्मर अपनी मेहनत से सेंट्रल पूल में देता है। तो क्या पंजाब को पूरी-की-पूरी बिजली नहीं मिलनी चाहिए जिससे कि पंजाब का फार्मर पूरी तरह सेंट्रल पूल में फ्रूट दे सके ?

SHRl R V RANGAYYA, NAIDU What I have said is, during (he surplus season, after meeting the requirements of Punjab farmers fully, only additional power available, is sent to Rajasthan; not at the cost of the farmers of Punjab

MR, CHAIRMAN Question No 502.

Breach of Nonas of JonraaJjite Ethics

502. SHRI GOVINDRAO ADIK; Will the Minister-of INFORMATION & BROAD-CASTING be pleased to state .

(a) whether it is a fact that several newspspers, news-megazines and journals have been indeded by the Press Council of India in the recent past and later convicted by the courts for breach of norms of journalistic ethics *and* for denigrating public men of eminence;

(b) if so, the names of publications which *heve* been indicted and*;ti* convicted, showing lines and sentences imposed in each case during the period from April, 1993 to March 1994; and

(c) what action Government have taken so far or propose to take to curb such tendency of mud-slinging on eminent public men by the *newspapers*. news-megazines and journals?

TOE MIMISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI K. P. SING!* DEO):(a) and (b) A statement showing publication indicted by the Press Council of India during April, 1993 to March, 1994 is laid on the table of the House. (See below) The Government does not MAINTAIN record of con-VICTIONS OF PUBLICATIONS BY COURTS.

(c) The Government has not such proposal, as adaquate remedies are already available

Statement

LIST of Important Newspapers Censured Duriag 1993-94

1 Complaint of Ms. Rekha against Naya Khoon, Hindi Fortnightly, New Delhi.

2. Conipiaint of Shri Ram Kirpal of Lucknow against Swstantra Bharat Lucknow.

3 Complaint of Shri Ram Kirpal of Lucknow against Nispaksh Pratidin, Lucknow.

4 Complaint of Shri Ram Kirpal of Lucknow against Chetna Vichardhara, Lucknow.

5. Complaint of Shir Ram Kirpal of Lucknow against Swatantra Chetna of Lucknow

6. Complaint of Addl. Commissioner of Police. CID, Bombay against Navakal, Marathi daily, Bombay.

7 Complaint of Dr. Wazid Ali Khan against Talat Ki Awaz, Hindi Weekly, Muzaf-farnagar.

8. Complaint of Dr. Mathan Kumar Denial against Police News Weekly, Madras.

9. Complaint of Shankar Namkeen Bhandar, Saharanpur against Chhinley Aur Bouchharey issue dated 25-6-1992.

10. Complaint of Shankar Namkeen Bhandar, Saharanpur against Chhintey Aur Bouchharey itsue dated 19-6-1992.

11. Complaint of Shankar Namkeen Bhandar, Saharanpur against Chhintey Aur Bouchharey issue dated 19-7-1992

12 Complaint of Shri H.P. of Shri Factory Manager, Star Paner Mills. Saharanpur against Chhintey Aur Bouchharey

13-15 Complaint of Shri Niranjan Lal Sharma (B) Shri Ram Krishan Savada and (c) Bhai tiys Lflkhak Patrakar Sangh. Bombay against Bahujan Sangharh, Hind: Weekly Delhi.

16. Complint of Ms- Harinder Kaur of Karra against National Service, Lucknow

17 Complaint of Dr A R Bedar, Director Khuda Baksh Oriental Public Library

Patna against Azimabad Express, Patna.

18. Complaint of Ms. Kahakashan against ' International Urdu Media, New Delhi

19. Complaint of Shri Damodar Prasad Goya] of Jaipur against Kootyudh, a daily evening Newspaper, Jaipur.

20. Complaint of Smt Sudha Rani Aggarwal Teacher Shri Agarsen Public School, Jaipur against 'Kootyudh' a Hindi evening Newspaper, Jaipur.

21. Complaint of Shri Sudarshan Mahajan Advocate & District President of BJP, Sihore, against 'Satpurha Vani' of Bhopal.

22. Complaint of President, Ambedkar Seva Samiti and others,. Rajnandgaon against 'Nandgaon Times' Rajnandgaon (M.P.).

23. Complaint of President, The Buddhist Society of India, Rajnanadgaon M. P. against 'Nandgaon Times' Rajnandgaon.

24. Complaint of Principal Govt. Degree College, Banda U.P. against IMandakini Dhara', Hindi daily of Banda, U.P.

25. Complaint of Dr. Shankar Dan Ojha, IAS, the then D. M. Banda against Local Editor 'Amar Ujala' Hindi Dainik, Kanpur, U.P.

26. Complaint of Ms. Vranda Sahay, Principal Govt College (Dabra), Gwalior against Dabra Sandesh, Weekly.

27. Complaint of Shri S. M. Khan, Information Officer, CBI New Delhi against Indian Express, New Delhi.

28. Complaint of Govt of Assam. Home (b) Department, Guwahati against Budhbar, Guwahati

29., Complaint of Dr. Pushpandra Sharma of .Petiaped. against Langoti Swar, Hindi Weeklty. (M.P.).

30. Complaint of Deputy Director, International Centre for Yoga Education. Kot-takuppam against Police, Tamil Weekly, Madras.

31. Complaint of Headmaster, The High Range School, Munnar against Munnar News, (Kerala).

12. Complaint of Secretary, Saksharatha Sangram Samiti, Raichur against Lankesh Patrika, Bangalore.

33. Complaint of Secretary, Bhatkal Jamarul Muslimeen, Bangalore, against Canara Times Mangalore.

34. Complaint of Shri G. C. Arya of New Delhi against Ashutosh. Hindi Weekly, Bhopal.

35. Complaint of Dr. A R Bedar, Director Khuda Baksh Oriental Public Library, Patna against Azimabad Express, Patna.

List of Newspapers Warned During 1993-94

1. Complaint of Dr. (Mrs.) M. Dani, Durg (M P-) against Hindi daily Amrii Sandesh of Raipur and Nandgaon Times Hindi daily of Rajnandgaon.

2. Complaint of Shri Jawahar Lal Singla of Jind against 'Bal Hans Ki Pukar', Hindi Weekly of Narwana, Jind (Haryana)

3. Complaint of Shri Shyarn Vir Singh of New Delhi against "Nav Bharat Times', New Delhi

4. Complaint of Shri Rajmohan Prasad, Arms Clerk, Office of District Magistrate, Banda, Uttar Pradesh against 'Mandakani Dhara', Hindi daily of Banda.

5. Complaint of Shri R. L. Kain, General Secretary, Dr. B. R Ambedkar Vichar Manch (Regd.) Delhi against The Editor, The Pioneer', New Delhi.

6. Complaint of Smt Savita Khurana, Principal, Shri Sukhanlal Adarsh Kanya Inter College, Meerapur, Muzaffarnagar against Editor, "Samaj Aur Naam', Hindi Weekly, Meerapur, Muzaffarnagar.

7. Complaint of Shri Surya Pratap Singh, Ex-DM Bijnor (now posted at Nainital against 'Kantak Path', Hindi Weekly of Bijnor.

8. Complaint of Shri Babu Singh Chauhan, Publisher, Bijnor Tvmes (UP) against Shri

Dilwar Singh Chauhan, Chief Editor, 'Kan-tak Path; Hindi Weekly of Bijnor.

9. Complaint of Shri Dilawar Singh Chauhan, Chief Editor, 'Kantak Path', Hindi Weekly, Bijnor against "Shram Bheri' Hindi Weekly of Bijnor.

10. Complaint of Shri R M. Tripathy, General Manager, Ordnance Equipment Factory, Hazratpur (Tundla), Ferozabad (U.P.) against 'Brij Samrat' a local Hindi Weakly of Tundla.

11. Complaint of Smt. Sheila Dixit, Shri K Natwar Singh, Shri K. N. Singh against "Sunday*. Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar, M. P. (Columnist).

12. Complaint of Shri Satpal Singh Chhabra against Saharanpur Darshan, a Hindi Weekly.

13. Complaint of Shri D. C. Khandelwal, Assistant Engineer, R.S.E.B, Beawar, Rajasthan against Dainik Nirantar, Beawar, Rajasthan.

14. Complaint of Shri Debendra Kishore Tripathi, Chairman, Panchayat Samiti, Ersama (Cuttack) against The Samaj Oriya Daily published from Cuttack.

15. Complaint of Shri P. C. Paul Under Secretary, Govt, of Assam, Home (B) Department, Dispur, against 'Budhbar', an Assamese Weekly of Guwahati

16. Complaint of Dr. A S. Saini, Director, Medical College, Rohtak against Dainik Hindustan, Hindi daily of New Delhi.

17. Complaint of Shri Shakil-Ur-Rahman Shamsi, journalist, Pilibhit (U.P.) against Rashtriya Sahara, Delhi and Lucknow Editions.

18. Complaint of Shri E. Sri Kumar against Nav Bharat Times, New Delhi.

19. Complaint of Postmaster General, Jodhpur and Supdt. of Post Offices, Barmer Division, New Delhi against Trikal Jyoti, Hindi Fortnightly of Balotara (Rajasthan).

20 & 21 Complaints of Prof. Javed Khan former Cabinet Minister, State of Maharashtra against 'Apia Mahanagar' Marathi daily and 'Hamara Mahanagar' Hindi da0y of Bombay.

22 & 73 Complaints of Shri P. R Ramteke, Lecturer in English, Hinganghat, Wardha against Vidharbha Chandika, Hindi Weekly Mahasagar, Marathi daily of Nagpur, (Maharashtra).

24. Complaint of Shri S. Krishna Murthy, Police Constable, Chikmagalur against Malenadu Sangathi, Kannada Daily, Chikmagalur.

25. Complaint of Dr. Ganesh Prasad, District President/Regional Medical and Rural Community Health Service Union, Lalitpur against 'Kamal Awaz' Hindi Weekly, Lalitpur.

26. Complaint of Ms. Uma Dongre. Gwalior against Dainik Bhaskar, Gwalior.

27. Complaint of the President, I.M.A. Branch, Guna (M.P.) against 'Janasatta', New Delhi

28. Complaint of Shri S. Ramakrishnan, Addl. Commissioner of Police, New Delhi-Range against Rashtriya Sahara, New Delhi.

29. Complaint of Deputy Secretary to the Government of Assam, Home (wP) Department, Dispur against Budhbar. Assam Weekly, Guwahati.

30. Complaint of Commissioner of Police. Greater Bombay against Navakal, Marathi Daily, Bombay.

List of Newspapers AdatoaJsaed Duriag 1993-94

1. Complaint of Commissioner of Police, Nasik (Maharashtra) against 'Rambhoomi' Marathi Daily, Nasik.

SHRI GOVINDRAO ADIK: Mr. Chairman. Sir, the answer given to my question is not complete. In part (a) of the question, I had asked whether any of these journals were punished by the courts for breach of norms of journalistic ethics. The answer is not given. Part (c) of my question is also not properly replied to. Part (c) of my question is whether the Government has

taken any action against these people or proposes to take any action against these newspapers, and that is also not replied to. So, through you. Sir, I would request the hon. Minister to give the answers correctly and then allow us to ask the supplementaries.

SHRI K. P SINGH DEO: Sir, as I have said in pans (a) and (b), the Government does not maintain a record of convictions of publications by courts. If you so direct. Sir, then we shall have to write to the courts to find out whether any such conviction is taking place. We do not have records of courts' convictions.

SHRI GOVINDRAO ADIK: Sir, now, we are seeing that many periodicals and weeklies are coming out in a very big number and the idea behind these newspapers is altogether different It is no more journalism now. It is only yellow journalism, as it is called. Many antisocial elements have entred into it and their idea is to make business out of it. So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether his Ministry is seriously considering this aspect of yellow journalism which is vitiating our political and social life. Unless the registration of these newspapers is considered seriously by the Department, I think. Sir, it is very difficult for any person to work in social life or political life. So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether his Ministry has considered this aspect and whether any steps have been taken *by* them.

SHRI K. P. SINGH DEO: Sir. most of these aspects are considered. There are certain guidelines on which registration of newspapers is done and if there are any specific suggestions which the hon. Member would like to give, we may like to study them and analyse them. I cannot give a sweeping response to a hypo-thethical question.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Sir. totally false news items denigrating public men are appearing in these newspapers which are called yellow journals. They say that they are political weeklies. But not action could be taken. Neither the Press Council nor the Government has taken any action, so, I would like to know from the Minister whether the Government will come out with a Bill to put down this menace of yellow journalism without offending or affecting the Press freedom. I would like to know whether the Government can consider bringing in a Bill on this issue because it has become a menace in Tamil Nadu.

MR CHAIRMAN: It is a balanced statement without affecting the Press freedom.

SHRI KL P SINGH DEO: Sir. there is already a Bill in this House, moved as a Private Member s Bill, by one of the hon. Members. But ths Press Council itself feels that there are enough safeguards, enough provisions in the law itself to take care of this thing. They arc not very keen that anything else should be done to curb the freedom of the Press.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir. I believe in the freedom of Press. There can be no misunderstanding on that. But it is also true that the problem of yellow journalism is becoming a menace in the country particularly because the Government is actively considering, we are told, the publication of foreign newspapers in the country. That is what the Press reports say. We are not only having liberalised economy but liberalised media also so far as foreign newspapers are concerned. In view of the fact that the Government is actively considering the question of giving permission to foreign newspapers to publish their editions from the country, does the Government believe that the problem of journalistic ethics should be seriously looked into?

and the matters should be taken up with the Press Council *no* that yellow journalism which is a pant of western life does not get itself infiltrated into our country.

SHRI K. P SINGH DEO: Sir, as far as the entry of foreign newspapers is concerned. Government has not yet allowed it It is guided by the Cabinet.decision of 195S, but it does not preclude the Government at all from thinking or considering any proposal if it comes, either to reject or to accept to modify. And whenever proposals come, it is incombat on Government to exercise its mind, apply its mind, consider and then reject or accept or modify, or whatever it is. And proposals have come and therefore, the Government must consider them. Whether they are acceptable or not, that is a different matter altogether. So, the hon. Member is right that the Government is considering. If any proposal comes, it will consider. It may reject it or it may accept it; that is different. But so far, we have not allowed any foreign newspapers to come in, excepting scientific journals, and we are guided by the Cabinet decision of 1955 and it has not been changed so far.

A* far as journalistic ethics and yellow journalism are concerned. Sir, it is a matter of suggestion. We are in constant touch with the Press Council of India, and I shall convey the sentiments of this House to the Press Council of India.

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Sir. although the Minister has not replied fully and properly to part (c) of the question, I don't mind; when the primary questioner has accepted the answer, I cannot say anything, but. Sir, I have some doubts in my mind. We. see that small newspapers are mushrooming in small subdivisions, districts and towns throughout the country in almost all languages and most of them thrive on scandal-mongering and yellow journalism and they really hit below the belt I would like to know whether the Government has any idea to control the mushrooming of undesirable newspapers booming in the country.

SHRI K. P. SINGH DEO: Govt, deoa not believe in controlling the freedom of the Press and ha expression, if anyone is violating the ethics, there are enough safeguards in the Press Council Act and the Indian Penal Code. Any Indian citizen can take recourse to that

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: If they are not doing their duly, even then do you want to say so? It is primarily the responsibility of the Government.

MR CHAIRMAN: It is dangerous for Government to interfere too much in this. Syed Sibtey Razi . . . *(Interruptions)*. . .

सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी : माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने उत्तर में कहा है कि उनके पास कोई ऐसा रिकार्ड नहीं है जिससे वह बता सकें कि अब तक कितने केसिस फाइल किए गए और भारतीय दण्ड संहिता के हिसाब से किस-किस का प्रोसिक्यूशन हुआ है। आज हमारे जो भाषाई पेपर्स हैं, मुख्य रूप से हमारे अपने प्रदेश का तजुर्बा यह है कि जब साम्प्रदायिक दंगे होते हैं या तनाव होता है तो ये एकपक्षीय रुख अख्तियार कर लेते हैं, वह चाहे किस भाषा के हों, उससे तनाव बढ़ता है। उसके अलावा भी जैसे किस तरह से करेक्टर एसेसिनेशन कई मुकामात पर हुए हैं, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से स्पष्ट जानना चाहूंगा क्योंकि ऐसे सामाजिक मुद्दे जहां व्यक्ति का सम्बन्ध नहीं है, समाज का सम्बन्ध है, व्यक्ति तो अपनी अपमानना का किसी न किसी तरीके से, अगर उसके पास रिसोर्सिस हैं तो, बदला ले सकता है, लेकिन जहां तक सामाजिक जिम्मेदारियां हैं, आपने अब तक ऐसे अखबारों के खिलाफ कितने केसिस कायम किए हैं और उन केसिस की क्या स्थिति है ?

भारतीय सरकार ने ऐसे अखबारों के खिलाफ, जिन्होंने जनहित के खिलाफ काम किया है, सरकार ने उनके खिलाफ कितने केसिस कायम किए हैं, क्या उसकी सूचना आपके पास है ?

श्री सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी: माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने उत्तर में कहा है कि उनके पास कोई ऐसा रिकार्ड नहीं है जिससे वह बता सकें कि अब तक कितने केसिस फाइल किए गए और भारतीय दण्ड संहिता के हिसाब से किस-किस का प्रोसिक्यूशन हुआ है। आज हमारे जो भाषाई पेपर्स हैं, मुख्य रूप से हमारे अपने प्रदेश का तजुर्बा यह है कि जब साम्प्रदायिक दंगे होते हैं या तनाव होता है तो ये एकपक्षीय रुख अख्तियार कर लेते हैं, वह चाहे किस भाषा के हों, उससे तनाव बढ़ता है। उसके अलावा भी जैसे किस तरह से करेक्टर एसेसिनेशन कई मुकामात पर हुए हैं, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से स्पष्ट जानना चाहूंगा क्योंकि ऐसे सामाजिक मुद्दे जहां व्यक्ति का सम्बन्ध नहीं है, समाज का सम्बन्ध है, व्यक्ति तो अपनी अपमानना का किसी न किसी तरीके से, अगर उसके पास रिसोर्सिस हैं तो, बदला ले सकता है, लेकिन जहां तक सामाजिक जिम्मेदारियां हैं, आपने अब तक ऐसे अखबारों के खिलाफ कितने केसिस कायम किए हैं और उन केसिस की क्या स्थिति है ? मेरा तजुर्बा यह है कि जब साम्प्रदायिक दंगे होते हैं या तनाव होता है तो ये एकपक्षीय रुख अख्तियार कर लेते हैं, वह चाहे किस भाषा के हों, उससे तनाव बढ़ता है। उसके अलावा भी जैसे किस तरह से करेक्टर एसेसिनेशन कई मुकामात पर हुए हैं, मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से स्पष्ट जानना चाहूंगा। क्योंकि ऐसे सामाजिक मुद्दे जहां व्यक्ति का सम्बन्ध नहीं है, समाज का सम्बन्ध है, व्यक्ति तो अपनी अपमानना का किसी न किसी तरीके से, अगर उसके पास रिसोर्सिस है तो, बदला ले सकता है, लेकिन जहां तक सामाजिक जिम्मेदारियां हैं, आपने अब तक ऐसे अखबारों के खिलाफ कितने केसिस कायम किए हैं और उन केसिस की क्या स्थिति है ?

کیسز قائم کرتے ہیں۔ کیا اس کی سوچ آپ کے پاس ہے

SHRI K. P. SINGH DEO: Sir, Government does not institute cases but in the case of communal disharmony or discord or exciting communal passions, the PIB, the State Governments and the Chief Secretaries of the Union Territories are addressed. And from the Government side, there is a guideline when DAVP denies any financial support; otherwise, the Government does not institute any cases against them. It is left to the State Governments if they would like to do. There are provisions in the Press Council Act and in the Indian Penal Code and any individual can do it. In fact, I answered the question in part (a) and (b) of the answer. There were more than 30 cases last year, 1993-94, where complaints had been made to the Press Council and one of the complainants was admonished. That was also given as part of die answer.

श्री हाजी माबा सिंह : मान्यवर, मैं माननीय मंत्री के उत्तर के सम्बन्ध में यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि उन्होंने अपने उत्तर में ऐसे 31 समाचार पत्रों का उल्लेख किया है जिनको चेतावनी दी गई है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि जो चेतावनी दी गई है वह किसके द्वारा दी गई है और क्या भारतीय प्रेस परिषद के द्वारा दी गई है ? साथ ही यह भी जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या अदालत में अभ्यारोप दाखिल करने का अधिकार भारतीय प्रेस परिषद को है ? यदि भारतीय प्रेस परिषद को अभ्यारोप दाखिल करने का अधिकार है, तो निश्चित रूप से कितने मामलों में अदालत ने दण्ड देने का काम किया है ? इसका भी विवरण भारतीय प्रेस परिषद के पास होगा। यदि नहीं है तो दण्ड देने के मामले में भारतीय प्रेस परिषद का अधिकार क्षेत्र क्या है ?

SHRI K. P. SINGH DEO: The Press Council of India is the body which admonishes or warns or censors. It does not institute cases. The Press Council-has a large number of functions which are there in the Press Council Act which was repealed in 1978. If you permit me. Sir, I will take a little time to go through the functions of the Press Council, if the hon. Members want me to do so. It is available in the Parliament Library.

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script

MR CHAIRMAN: That should be enough.

SHRI K P SINGH DEO:There is subsection 2 of section 13 and there are ten other sub-sections which give the exact functioning of the Press Council. The powers are under section 14 of the Act The Press Council does not institute cases. It is a quasi-judicial body. It depends on the social and moral authority and self-regulation and not on punitive or deterrent provisions. It is not a parallel court of law.

Supply of Telephone Inatnuaeata

*503. SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD :†
SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA:

Will the Minister of COMMUNICATIONS be pleased to state ;

(a) whether Government have since taken a decision to stop supplying instruments to telephone subscribers; and

(b) if so, the details and the reasons therefore ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF POWER (SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU ON BEHALF OF THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS (SHRI SUKH RAM): (a) and (b) Sir. the proposal to discontinue the supply of telephone instruments to the subscribers is under active consideration of the Government.

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: Sir, it seems that the Minister is trying to give the reason as the so-called active consideration. Part (b) of my question is: "If so, the details and the reasons therefor?" The Government is considering the proposal when they are bound to give all the necessary details. The reply does not contain any of the details. Moreover, a customer cannot purchase the equipment or instrument In that case he has to buy it from the private market. The question is of providing repair and other services to the customers. If one department manages the communication wires and the other agency manages the instruments and the repairs, I think, it will lead to a lot of difficulties to the customers. There are vast areas in the villages where there is no facility and if the villagers want a new telephone connection they

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the Houses by Shri N. Giri Prasad.